7 H D1PX P E H U

Maricruz Hinojoza et al.

Applicants

v.

Republic of Fiscalandia

Respondent

MEMORIAL FOR THE STATE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INDEX OF AUTHORITIES L Y

STATEMENT OF FACTS

A. Background on the Republic of Fiscalandia

B. Factual Background of Petitions Before the IACHR

C. Proceedings Before the IACHR

LEGAL ANALYSIS

I. MARIANO REX, MAGDALENA ESCOBAR, AND MARICRUZ HINOJOZA FAILED TO EXHAUST DOMESTIC REMEDIES, THUS THE MERITS OF THE CASE SHOULD NOT BE CONSIDERED.

A. Domestic remedies were not exhausted in relation to each of the Petitioners actions

a. Rex failed to exhaust domestic remedies by not bringing any domestic legal action to challenge the administrative decision to remove him from office

b. Escobar failed to exhaust domestic remedies because the judgment on the merits of the motion to vacate had not yet been issued when Escobar filed her petition

c. Hinojoza and Mastro failed to exhaust domestic remedies by not filing a motion to vacate

RESPECT AND GURANTEE HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE PRINCIPLE OF EQUALITY AND NON- DISCRIMINATION.

A. Fiscalandia did not deprive Escobar of her Article 24 right to equal protection when it authorized the creation of the nominating board for the selection of a new Prosecutor General because nominating a suitable head of office to replace a senior official whose term of office had expired served a legitimate state purpose in furtherance of an aim in accordance with international law norms

% The selection process of the appointment of Prosecutor General did not violate Article 24 in relation to Hinojoza and Mastro because President Obregón selected the Prosecutor General after prior scrutiny by an independent entity comprised of both state and civil society members to ensure impartiality and equal access to public office

« « « «

Edward v. United Kingdom (XU &W + 5 VHU $ 1R %

Fermín Ramírez v. Guatemala, Merits, Reparations, and Costs, Judgment, Inter-Am. Ct. H.R

VHU & 1R -XQH

,$&+5 $GPLVVLELOLW\ 5HSRUW 1R 7ðpOÀaWLWPLRQ Àð

7HDP 1XPEHU

J. v. Peru 3UHOLPLQDU\ 2EMHFWLRQV 0HULWV 5HSDUDWLRQV

1R 1RY

Kurbogaj v. Spain 'HFLVLRQ DGRSWHG -XO\

Loayza Tamayo v. Peru 0HULWV$P &QWH+U5 VHU & 1R 6HSW

Mémoli v. Argentina 3UHOLPLQDU\ 2EMHFWLRQV 0HULWV 5HSDUDUDW

$P &W + 5 VHU & 1R $XJ

5HSRUW 1R &DVH *María Eugenia Morales de Sierra.* *XDWHPDOD -DQXDU

5HSRUW 1R &DVH 0HULWV *María Eugenia Morales de Sierra* *X

5HSRUW 1R &DVH 0HULWV *Adán Guillermo López Lone et al. v. Hon

1RYHPEHU

5HSRUW 1R &DVH *Undocumented Workers v. United States of America*

1RYHPEHU

Ricardo Canese vs. No. Paraguay 0HULWV 5HSDUDWLRQV DQG &RVWV -XO

Suárez Rosero v. Ecuador 0HULWV -XGJPHQW ,QWHU $P &W + 5 VH

Tarazona Arrieta et al. v. Peru 3UHOLPLQDU\ 2EMHFWLRQV 0HULWV 5HS

-XGJPHQW$P &QWH+U5 VHU & 1R 2FW

Velasquez-Rodriguez v. Honduras 0HULWV$P ,QWHU + 5 VHU & 1R -XO

7HDP 1XPEHU

,$&+5 /HJDO 6WDQGDUGV *URXS (TXDOLW\ DQG (IILFLHQF\ 5

+XPDQ 5LJKWV 6\VWHP 'HYHORSPHQW DQG $SSOLFDWLRQ

DSSURYHG RQ -DQXDU\

,$&+5 7KH 5RDG WR 6XEVWDQWLYH 'HPRFUDF\ :RPHQ¶V 3R

2($ 6HU / 9 ,, 'RF UOLO °•ð0 @

@$PHULFD 6€€LLQÀQÀ1 PPL`LÀÀÀÀÀÀ

+XPDQ 5L KWV $PÀ PQ 20ÀLRQ 2, 2'U H

@DF

Report on Action with Respect to Habeas Data and the Right to Access to Information in th3-1

7HDP 1XPEHU

,$&+5 5HSRUW RI WKH 2IILFH RI WKH 6SHFLDO 5DSSRUWHXU

³,QWHUL FDQ /HJDO)UDPHZRUN 5HJDUGLQJ WKH 5LJ

2($ 6HU / 9 ,, &,'+ 5(/(,1)

,$&+5 5HSRUW RI WKH 2IILFH RI WKH 6SHFLDO 5DSSRUWHXU

³,QWHU $PHULFDQ /HJDO)UDPHZRUN 5HJDUGLQJ WKH 5LJKW WR)UHHGRP

2($ 6HU / 9 ,, &,'+ 5(/(,1)

,$&+5 $QQXDO 5HSRUW $QQXDO 5HSRUW RI WKH 2IILFH

)UHHGRP RI ([SUHVVLRQ &KDSWHU ,9 7KH 5LJKW RI $FFH

'RF 'HFHPEHU

,$&+5 $QQXDO 5HSRUW $QQXDO 5HSRUW RI WKH 2IILFH

)UHHGRP RI ([SUHVVLRQ 2($ 6HU / 9 ,, 'RF 'HFHPEHU

,$&+5 $QQXDO 5HSRUW $QQXDO 5HSRUW RI WKH 2IILFH

)UHHGRP RI ([SUHVVLRQ &KDSWHU ,,, 7KH 5LJKW WR $FFH

$PHULFDV 2($ 6HU / 9 ,, 'RF 'HFHPEHU

STATEMENT OF FACTS

A. Background on the Republic of Fiscalandia

SDUWLFLSDWLRQ LQ WKH DSSRLQWPHQWV WKH ODZ SURYL
WZHOYH PHPEHUV WKUHH XQLYHUVLW\ GHDQV WKUHH PHP
$VVRFLDWLRQ WKUHH VLWWLQJ MXGJHV DQG WKUHH PHPE
3UHVLGHQW RI)LVFDODQGLD)XUWKHUPRUH WKH 1RPLQDV
ZLOO EH VFUHHQHG EDVHG RQ WKHUSDUOLQWVLKORHQVHVWWUHDIQLF
FLWL]HQ SDUWLFLSDWLRQ

1RPLQDWLQJ %RDUGV RSHUDWH LQGHSHQGHQWO\ DQG
SDUW RI WKH 'JRHYHUQWKHQWG LYHUVH FRPSRVLWLRQ RI HDFK
PHPEHUVYLDOUHFLYDQWV DQG DV VXFK QRPLQDWLQJ ERDUG
DFFRXQWDELOLW\ UHSEHRUGVLQJWKHFWRPLQDWLQJ %RDU
ERDUG IXOO GLVFUHWLRQ WR GHWHUPLQH WKH HYDOXDWLR
SURFHVV

7KH 2IILFH RI WKH 3URVHFXWRU *HQHUDO LV RQH RI WK
VXSHUYLVRU\ IXQFWLRQV RI WKH 3UXEOLFXRZKRVHQWHQDQ
WKH KHDG RI WKH 2IILFH RLWKH3HUFWHGXEVRUKH3QHUDOG HQ
D VKRUWOLVW RI WKUHH F QFK FK0DH LW H *Ð<UDKH SXE Q

3UHVLGHQW 2EUHJyQ WR HOHFW WR JR EH\RQG LQWHUQDWLRQDO

ILJKW DJDLQVW WHUURULVP WKURXJK FRRSHUDWLRQ *HQHUDO (VFREDU RS

NLQG RI LQWHUQDWLRQDO EDUULHUV KDG EHHQ GHG WR WKH UHSRUWV

VSHFLDO XQLW WR LQYHVWLJDWH SRVVLEOH FULPHV DOOHJ

*LYHQ WKH VHULRXVQHVV RI WKH UHSRUW¶V DOOHJDWL

YDULRXV OHYHOV RI JRYHUQPHQW 3UHVLGHQW 2EUHJyQ XU

FRUUXSWLRQ ZLWKLQ WKH)LVFDODQGLDQ JRYHUQPHQW 2E

'HFUHH RUGHULQJ WKH FUHDWLRQ RI WKH QRPLQDWLQJ ER

DV 3URVHFXWRU *HQHUDO (VFREDU ILOHG D PRWLRQ WR

DFW ZLWK WKH 7HQWK $GPLQLVWUDWLYH &RXUW RI %HUHQ

([WUDRUGLQDU\ 3UHVLGHQWLDO 'HFUHH DQG VRXJKW LQMX

VXVSHQG 2EDUHJyQ¶V FRQVWLWXWLRQDO ULJKWV DQG GXW\ WR H

H[HFXWLYH EUDQFK SXUVXDQW WR WKH OHJLVODWLYH DQG

ODZ\HU WKH 6HFRQG &KDPEHU RI $SSHDOV RI %HUHQD

7ZR PRQWKV ODWHU (VFREDU DQG WKH SURVHFXWRUV

FRQIHUHQFH ZKHUH WKH\ DQQRXQFHG WKH ILOLQJ RI D IRU

RI)LVFDODQGLD DJDLQVW WKH LQGLYLGXDOV LPSOLFDWHG

$IWHU WKH FRXUWV DOORZHG WKH 3UHVLGHQW¶V FDOO

FDQGLGDWH 3UHVLGHQW 2EUHJyQ H[HFXWHG WKH ([WUDRU

+\SRWKHWLFDO ^

+\SRWKHWLFDO ^

+\SRWKHWLFDO ^

Id.

+\SRWKHWLFDO ^

+\SRWKHWLFDO ^

+\SRWKHWLFDO ^

DSSRLQW WKH PHPEHUV RI7KHUHQVRSHLFWDLWLQJ EDQGW LQJ E

DQQRXQFHPHQW LQYLWLQJ DQ\RQH 1XPLU ÐU] RPLQ•4PV•@C

PHPEHU RI WKH QRPLQDWLQJ ERDUG WKH\ VKRXOG KDYH U

HYDOXDWHG QRPLQDWLQJ ERDUG 7KXV OXGRYLF GRQGLV VKRU

2Q 6HSWHPEHU 'RPLQJR 0DUWLQH] ³0DUWLQH]´

*HQHUDO RI WKH 5HSXEOLF HQGLQJ (VFREDU 7KHUHDIWHU

(VFREDU ZDV DVVLJQHG WR VHUYH DV D SURVHFXWRU LQ W

C. Proceedings Before the IACHR

2Q $XJXVW (VFREDU ILOHG D SHWLWLRQ ZLWK W

$PHULFDQ &RQYHQWLRQ 7KHQ, $&+5 GHFLGHG WKH SHWLWLRQ DGPL

$XJXVW LVVXHG LWV 0HULWV 5HSRUW ZKHUH LW IRX

GXULQJ WKH UHTXLVLWH WLPH SHULRG DQG &RXUW RI $SSHDOV

5LJKWV

LEGAL ANALYSIS

I. MARIANO REX, MAGDALENA ESCOBAR, AND MARICRUZ HINOJOSA FAILED TO EXHAUST DOMESTIC REMEDIES, THUS THE MERITS OF THE CASE SHOULD NOT BE CONSIDERED.

8QGHU $UWLFOH 3HWLWLRQHU PXVW H[KDXVW GRPHVWLF UH

ILOLQJ D SHWLWLRQ *LQWKH UDKHO &RWWRKLHV [LRDX VWLRQ UHTXLU

DSSHDOLQJ WR WKH KLJKHVW GRPHVWLF FRXUW ZLWK MXUL

6WDWH REMHFWV WKDW GRPHVWLF UHPHGLHV KDYH QRW E

SURYLQJ ZKLFK HPEHGGHG LQ WKH +XPDQ 5LJKWV &RPPLW

$PHULFDQ &RPPLVVLRQ RQ +XPDQ 5LJKWV DSSO\ WKH VWDQ

VXFFHVV´ LQ HYDOXDWLQJ *LJHFWLKYH6WDWH 3DUWV DUJ

³WHVWQRW HFWLYH UHPHG\ FDQQRW EH ZKHWKHU D FRPSOD

EXW UDWKHU ZKHWKHU KH LW • H •ó DÀ`XP0f•@ CHGAXWñH Añ

³ RUÍ`I WñWFH W WWñH• Añ H‹dE W

Rogan Balgado v. WLK YHKHOH6WDWH 3DUWV

A. Domestic remedies were not exhausted in relation to each of the Petitioners actions.

a. Rex failed to exhaust domestic remedies by not bringing any domestic legal action to challenge the administrative decision to remove him from office.

5H[IDLOHG WR H[KDXVW KLV GRPHVWLF UHPHGLHV DV

WR FKDOOHQJH WKH DGPLQLVWUDWLYH GHFLVLRQ WR DHPR

SHWLWLRQ ZLWK WKH &RXUW KDG FKDOOHQJHG WKH SHQD

UHPRYDO LPSRVHG E\ WKH 6XSUHPH &RXUW RI WKH 6WDWH

UHFRQVLGHUDWLRQ DGPLQLVWUDWLYH PHWKRG LV HIIHFWLYH DV LW SU

KH LV DEOH WR PDNH KLV FDVH DQG LI WKH 6XSUHPH &RXU

UHLQVWDWHPHQW 7KXV WKH 5HF[XHVW LV GH QRW PHHW WKH [KDXVW

KLP

b. Escobar failed to exhaust domestic remedies because the judgment on the merits of the motion to vacate had not yet been issued when Escobar filed her petition.

%HIRUH ILOLQJ ZLWK D FRPPLVVLRQ D SHWLWLRQHU P

&RQYHQWLRQ RQ WKH (OLPLQDWLRQ RI DOO)RUPV RI :RPHQ

&RPPLWWHH KDV KHOG WKDW WKH TXHVWLRQ RI ZKHWKHU

GHWHUPLQHG DW WKH WLPH RI LWV FRQVLGHUDWLRQ RI D

VXEPLWV WKH FRPPXQLFDWLRQ RQ WKH TXHVWLRQ PXVW EH ORGJHG ZL

GRPHVWLF UHPHGLHV DUH H[KDXVWHG ZKLFK EHJLQV ZKHQ

MXGJPHQW LV ILOHG ZLWK WKH FRPPLVVLRQ EHIRU

+\SRWKHWLFDO &RQYHQWLRQ RQ WKH (OLPLQDWLRQ RI DOO)RUPV RI
&ODULILFDWLRQ RQ 4XHVWLRQV RI JH
6HH $PHULFDQ &RQYHQWLRQ $UWLFOH
&RPPXQLFDWLRQ 1R <LOGLULP 9LHQQD ,QWHUYHQWLRQ &HQWU
IRU :RPHQ¶V $FFHVV WR -XVWLFH % $NEDN HW DO Y $XVWULD
,$&+5 $GPLVVLELOLW\ 5HSRUW *Ramon Nicolas Guarino* 3HWLWLRQHU 0DUFK
SDUD

7HDP 1XPEHU

PRWLRQ WR YDFDWH 7KXV WKH GRPHVWLF UHPHGLHV KDG

ILOHG ZLWK WKH FRPPLVVLRQQR0WC ZLWK WKH H@HHHHH@H

,Q WKLV FDVH 5H[FRXOG KDYH ILOHG D PRWLRQ IRU U
RI VXVSHQVLRQ 5HQ[GDUHJRRV DWWKDW DQ\ UHPHG\ KH PLJKW KD
EHHQ DGMXGLFDWHG DW WKH ILUVW LQVWDQFH E\ WKH VDP
WKHUHIRUH VKRXOG EH UHJDUGHG DV DQ H[FHSWLRQDO WR W
FRPSODLQDQW¶V PHUH GRXEWV DV WR WKH HIIHFWLYHQHVV
IURP FRPSO\LQJ ZLWK WKH H[KDXVWLRQ UHTXLUHPHQW

$GGLWLRQDOO\ )LVFODQGLD SURYLGHG (VFRVEHDN +LQR
GLIIHUHQW DYHQXHV WR H[HUFLVH WKHLU ULJKWV DQG WKH
HDFK RI WKHLU GHDOV ZLWK WKH H[KDXVWLRQ RI

A. Fiscalandia did not deprive Escobar of her Article 24 right to equal protection when it authorized the creation of the nominating board for the selection of a new Prosecutor General because nominating a suitable head of office to replace a senior official whose term of office had expired served a legitimate state purpose in furtherance of an aim in accordance with international law norms.

7KH 6WDWH RI)LVFDODQGLDQGEHOQMRXQFWLRQOD WLRQ$UWLFOH $UWLF

$&+5 LQ UHODWLRQ WR (VFREDU EHFDXVH QRQH RI WKH UL

&RQYHQWLRQ ZHUH YLRODWHG DV D UHVXOW RI DOOHJHG D

(VFREDU UHPDLQHG LQ RIILFH RQ D WUDQVLWLRQDO EDVLV

&RQVWLWXWLRQ VKH GLG QRW PHHW WKH KLJKHU TXDOLW

LQ WKH SURVHFXWRULDO SURFHVV RI WKH)LVFDODQGLDQ

RIILFH RQ D WUDQVLWLRQDO EDVLV

(VFREDU FRQWHQGV WKDW VKH KDV WKH ULJKW WR LUU

6XSUHPH &RXUW GHFLVLRQ DIIRUGV KHU ZKHUHZLWKDO

ZDV PDGH SULRU WR WKH 1LQWK 7UDQVLWLRQDO 3URYLVLR

KHU SRVLWLRQ DV EHLQJ$RG GLVWLQFWLRQ EHWZHHQ E

LV DQ RXWGDWHG GHFLVLRQ SUHFHGLQJ)LVFDODQGLD¶V IL

HVWDEOLVKPHQW RI)LVFDODQGLD¶V QHZ QDWLRQDO FRQV

UHFRJQL]HG WKDW SULQFLSOHV RI VHSDUDWLRQ RI SRZHU

UHVSHFW IRU KXPDQ ULJKWV VXSHUVHGHV DQ\ SXEOLF RIIL

RIILFH

+\SRWKHWLFDO ^
+\SRWKHWLFDO ^
+\SRWKHWLFDO ^

B. The selection process of the appointment of Prosecutor General did not violate Artic le 24 in relation to Hinojoza and Mastro because President Obregón selected the Prosecutor General after prior scrutiny by an independent entity comprised of both state and civil society members to ensure impartiality and equal access to public office.

) LVDO DQGLD¶V VHOHFWLRQ SURFHVV IRU 3URVHFXWRU

$PHULFDQ &RQYHQWLRQ $UWLFOH DQG GLG QRW VXEMHF

pu

A. Fiscalandia did not violate Article 8.1 and 25 of the Convention in relation to Article 1.1 and 2 because it provided Rex with a judicial proceeding regulated in the Judiciary Act of Fiscalandia.

3HWLWLRQHU DVVHUWV WKDW WKH GHFLVLRQ RI WKH)LVFDODQGLDQ &RXUW RI &DVVDWLRQ [ZDV JLYHQ

ULJKW WR D KHDULQJ RQ WKH PHULWV RI KLV FODLP DQG WKDW WKH GHFLVLRQ H[SOLFLW UHDVRQLQJ

GHFLVLRQ WR UHPRYH KLP 5H[PDLQWDLQV WKDW WKH GLVFUHWLRQDU\ DQG ³LQH[FXVDEOH´ QDWXUH

ODZ +RZHYHU &RXUW RI &DVVDWLRQ \ $FW RI)LVFDODQGLD VWDWHV WKDW WKH MXGJHV RI WKH &RXUW

IRUFH $UWLFOH &RXUW RI &DVVDWLRQ \ $FW VWDWHV WKDW IDLOLQJ WR VWDWH D UHDVRQ IRU MXGJHPHQWV DQG MXGLFLDO GHFLVLRQV DUH

ZKHQ 5H[IDLOHG WR VWDWH WKH UHDVRQ IRU WKH GHFLVLRQ WR UHPRYH KLP

ZDUUDQWHG DQ LQYHVWLJDWLRQ

,Q RUGHU WR GHWHUPLQH LI $UWLFOH KDV EHHQ YLRODWHG WKH &RXUW PXVW ILUVW GHWHUPLQH LI WKH GHFLVLRQ RI WKH &RXUW RI &DVVDWLRQ RI)LVFDODQGLD PDGH LQ 5H[ZDV D MXGLFLDO SURFHHGLQJ

B. Fiscalandia complied with Article 8.1 and 25 of the Convention in relation to Article 1.1 because it provided Escobar with a formal hearing.

(VFREDU VRXJKW LQMXQFWLYH UHOLHI DVNLQJ WKH FRX

FDOO IRU FDQGLGDWH QDPH ZDV XW HYLGHQWO\ UHYHUVH

ZDUUHDQWMR]D DQGDDPVWUR¶W)LVFDODQGLD IDLOHG WR FRP
+LQRMRQG 0DUQQUR Q H[WUDZLQDU\ SURFHHGLQJV &RQVWLWXFLRQ FRQWHQ
WKDW WKH LQDGPLVVLEOH *RYHUQPHQW WKHP WKHUH GXH SUR
KDG OHIW WKHP ZLWK QR UHPHG\ RU DSSHDO WKH &RQVWLWXWLRQ
DGHTXDWHO\ VWDWH WKH UHDVRQLQJ RI WKH &RXUW EHORZ
EHORZ DQG WKH FDOOHQJHG DQ\ UUHJXODUL
YDFDWH ZKLFK ZRXOG KDYH EHHQ DQ HIIHFWLYH UHPHG\ 6
%HUHQD FOHDUO\ VWDWHG DVSHRLQWHG RXW WKDW WKH 3URVHFX
SRZHU RI WKH H[HFXWLYH WR ZLWKGUDZ &RQVWLWXWLRQDO
&RXUW KDV FODULILHG WKDW DQ XQIDYRUDEOH UXOLQJ
LQHIIHFWLYHQHVV RI WKH UHPHG\ ILOHG RU WKDW >WKH\@

7KH 6WDWH¶V UHPHGLHV PXVW PDNH DQ HIIHFWLYH FR
DQG HQVXUH IXOO H[HUFLVH RI WKH SURFHGXUDO
&RXUW VWDWHG WKDW WKH 1RPLQDWLQJ %RDUGV ZHUH ³LQ
JRYHUQPHQW WKXV WKHLU DFWLRQV FRXOG QRW EH FKDO
ZRXOG KDYH EHHQ EHIRUH WKH DSSOLFDWLRQ
&RQVWLWXWLRQDO &RXUW]DRD%HUHQDV QRW FRQVLGKDY HLQRM
LUUHJXODULW\ LQ WKH DSSRLQWPHQW RU WHUPLQDWLRQ RI

Id.

&ODULILFDWLRQ 4XHVWLRQV $QVZHUV SDJH
(J*Mémoli v. Argentina* 3UHOLPLQDU\ 2EMHFWLRQV 0HULWV SHSDWLRQV D
VHV & 1R SDUD *Fermín Ramírez v. Guatemala* 0HULWV 5HSDUDWLRQV DQG
-XGJPHQWP ,&WHU 5 VHV & 1R SDUD -XQH
Chocrón Chocrón v. Venezuela $GPLVVLELOLW\1RHSRUWSHQ5HSDUDWLRQ + 5 3HWLWLRQ
ˆ 0DU
&ODULILFDWLRQ 4XHVWLRQV $QVZHUV SDJH
+\SRWKHWLFDO ˆ

IV. THE STATE OF FISCALANDIA FULFILLED ALL OF ITS LEGAL OBLIGATIONS TO RESPECT AND ENSURE THE RIGHT TO FREEDOM

$UWLFOHHDG LQ FRQMXQFWLRQ ZLWK $UWLFOHV DQG

HYHU\RQH KDV WKH ULJKW WR IUHHGRP RI H[SUHVVLRQ LG

@0 SU@3VA •€U

REOLJDWLRQ WR DGRSW PHDVXUHV WR HQVXUH WKH H[HUF

:KHQ WKH 2$6 DQG WKH 8QLWHG 1DWLRQV @

LQIRUPDWLRQ UHJDUGLQJ JRYHUQPHQW GHFLVLRQV RU DFW

YLRODWLRQV RI KXPDQ ULJKWV

, Q WKH *Claude-Reyes et al. v. Chile,* WKH &RXUW IRXQG WKDW &KLOH

ZKHQ LW UHIXVHG WR SURYLGH WKH 3HWLWLRQHUV ZLWK U

SURMHFW DQG IDLOHG WR RIIHU D YDOLG MXVWLILFDWLRQ

WKDW WKH ULJKW WR DFFHVV SXEOLF LQIRUPDWLRQ LQ 6W

WKH LQIRUPDWLRQ VRXJKW ZDV D PDWWHU RI SXEOLF LQWH

FRQVLGHUDEOH SXEOLF GHEDWH GXH WKH LWV SRVVLEOH H

GHYHORSPHQW ZRXOG KDYH &KLOH WKH &RXUW FODULILHG WKDW LW G

&KLOHDQ ODZV WR LWV DQDO\VLV RI ZKHWKHU WKH UHVWU

EHFDXVH WKH OD

C. Fiscalandia complied with established international law pertaining to the provision of certain limitations on the exercise of the rights and freedoms as necessary for the protection of public order, morals, and the rights and freedoms of others.

a. The State's refusal to hand over part of the information requested by Petitioners does not constitute a violation of the right to the freedom of thought and expression because the disclosure would frustrate the purpose of Article 13 by impeding the rights, freedoms, and expression of others.

(YHQ LI WKH LQIRUPDWLRQ VRXJKW LV ZLWKLQ WKH 3UH
MXVWLILDEO\ LPLWHG WKH H[HUFLVH RI WKH ULJKW DV QHFHVVD
7KH LQWHUQDWLRQDO SULQFLSOHV UHFRJQL]HG LQ MXU
LQWHUQDWLRQDO V\VWHPV KDYH UHFRJQL]HG WKDW WKH ULJKW
$UWLFOH RI WKH $&+5 SURYLGHV WKDW FHUWDLQ UHVWU
E\ WKH &RQYHQWLRQ DUH SRVVLEOH E\ ODZV HQDFWHG IRU
SXEOLF RUGHU RU SURWHFWLRQ RI SXEOLF KHDOWK LW LV
7KH ,$&+5 KDV HVWDEOLVKHG WKDW WKH ULJKW WR IUH
WZR GLPHQVLRQV WKH ³LQGLYLGXDO DQG VRFLDO RI WKH
WKDW PXVW EH JXDUDQWHHG VLPXOWDQHRXVO\ DQG WKH ´$&+5 GUDZV
GLVWLQFWLRQ EHWZHHQ SULYDWH DQG SXEOLF SHUVRQV ³DQG
FLWL]HQ FDQ DVVHUW WKHLU ULJKW WR SULYDF\ ZKHQ
KDUPIXO WR WKDW ULJKW ´
$V VXFK WKH ULJKWV RI PHPEHUV RI WKH 1RPLQDWLQJ
H[SUHVVLRQ PXVW EH JXDUDQWHHG VLPXOWDQHRXVO\ E\ W

$PHULFDQ &RQYHQWLRQ RQ +XPDQ 5LJKWV ³3DFW RI 6DQ -RVp´ 2UJ $XJ 7UHDW\ 6HULHV 1R

Nature Regulation of Sexuality in International Human